



# AAT Bulletin

ISSUE NO. 16/2013

22 APRIL 2013

The *AAT Bulletin* is a weekly publication containing a list of recent AAT decisions and information relating to appeals against AAT decisions. The Bulletin occasionally includes information on legislative changes that affect the AAT and other important developments.

It is recommended that the Bulletin be read on-line. This has the advantage of allowing the reader to use hyperlinks to access the full text of cases and other internet sites mentioned in the Bulletin.

The AAT does not make any representation or warranty about the accuracy, reliability, currency or completeness of any material contained in this Bulletin or on any linked site. While the AAT makes every effort to ensure that the material in the Bulletin is accurate and up-to-date, you should exercise your own independent skill and judgement before you rely on it. Information contained in this Bulletin is not legal advice and is intended as a general guide only. You should rely on your own advice or refer to the full cases and legislation in relation to any proceedings.

Enquiries regarding this publication may be directed to <u>aatweb@aat.gov.au</u>.

# CONTENTS

| AAT Recent Decisions        | 2 |
|-----------------------------|---|
| Compensation                | 2 |
| Freedom of Information      | 2 |
| Immigration and Citizenship | 2 |
| Social Security             | 3 |
| Trade and Commerce          |   |
| Veterans' Affairs           | 4 |
| Appeals Finalised           | 5 |
| Appeals lodged              | 5 |
| Appeals finalised           |   |

# **AAT Recent Decisions**

This section of the Bulletin provides information about decisions recently published by the AAT. Only AAT decisions that have been published on <u>AustLII</u> have been included. Full copies of the decisions can be accessed through the hyperlinks provided below.

### Compensation

Laviano and Comcare [2013] AATA 229; 16/4/2013; Senior Member AK Britton and Dr Alexander, Member

Commonwealth employees – Anxiety adjustment disorder and depressed mood – Whether the employee suffered from a disease – Whether the employee suffered a recognised psychiatric illness – Whether the employee suffered a psychiatric disorder or a condition "outside the bounds of normal mental functioning" – Decision under review affirmed

#### **Freedom of Information**

Keefe and Australian Government Solicitor [2013] AATA 202; 3/4/2013; Senior Member BJ McCabe

Australian Government Solicitor – 'Agency' under FOI Act – Decision not reviewable by Tribunal

# **Immigration and Citizenship**

DJYZ and Minister for Immigration and Citizenship [2013] AATA 218; 11/4/2013; Ms R Perton, Member

Cancellation of visa – Conviction for sexual offence – Character test – Exercise of discretion – Decision under review affirmed

Guo and Migration Agents Registration Authority [2013] AATA 225; 15/4/2013; Senior Member E Fice

Migration Agent – Breaches of the code of conduct – Caution issued – Subclass 457 visa – Business sponsor – Approved nomination – Withdrawal of a nomination – Claimed conflict of interest – Immigration assistance – Immigration legal assistance – Misleading information provided to the department – Agency and fiduciary duties – Subagency – Reputation and integrity of the migration agent advice profession – Fees and charges obligations – Failure to maintain proper records – Client's dependence on the agent's knowledge and experience – Obligation to provide information to Immigration when certain events occur – Sponsorship undertakings – Decision under review set aside and substituted Tran and Minister for Immigration and Citizenship [2013] AATA 235; 17/4/2013; Senior Member D Letcher, QC

Cancellation of visa – Does not pass character test – Substantial criminal record – Drug offence – Imprisonment of 12 months or more – Application of Direction 55 – Primary considerations – Other considerations – Discretion not to cancel not exercised – Decision affirmed

#### Social Security

Ahmed and Secretary, Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs [2013] AATA 227; 15/4/2013; Senior Member JF Toohey

Disability support pension – Blindness and astigmatism – Impairment rating five points – Whether post-traumatic stress disorder and depression diagnosed, treated and stabilised – Evidence of chronic post-traumatic stress disorder and depression – Applicant had not sought treatment for either at the relevant time – Decision under review affirmed

Habashi and Secretary, Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs [2013] AATA 232; 17/4/2013; Senior Member N Bell

Disability support pension – DSP – Impairment tables – Applicant does not meet impairment rating requirement – Decision under review affirmed

Kanyilmaz and Secretary, Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs [2013] AATA 224; 15/4/2013; Dr P McDermott, RFD, Senior Member

Pensions, benefits and allowances – Age pension – Unlimited portability of pension – Australian residency regained after absence – Absent within two years after regaining residency status – Age pension not payable while absent – Decision under review affirmed

MacDonald and Secretary, Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs [2013] AATA 233; 17/4/2013; Dr K Breen, Member

Disability support pension – Back injury – Crush fracture of the second lumbar vertebra – Hypertension – Conditions permanent – 10 impairment points – Decision under review affirmed.

Seaborn and Secretary, Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations [2013] AATA 228; 16/4/2013; Senior Member G Ettinger

Newstart Allowance – Whether the Applicant failed to accept an offer of suitable employment – Whether serious failure – Whether reasonable excuse – Decision under review affirmed

Sullivan and Secretary, Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs [2013] AATA 234; 17/4/2013; Dr M Denovan, Member

Pensions, benefits and allowances – Disability support pension – Not fully diagnosed, treated and stabilised – Impairment tables – No permanent conditions – No impairment rating – Decision under review affirmed

#### Trade and Commerce

Fairlight Instruments Pty Ltd and Australian Trade Commission [2013] AATA 231; 17/4/2013; Senior Member N Bell

Industry assistance – Export market development grant – Whether new business a continuation of previous business – Whether old and new business are similar – Decision under review set aside and remitted

#### Veterans' Affairs

La and Repatriation Commission [2013] AATA 222; 12/4/2013; Deputy President JW Constance

South Vietnamese Air Force – Qualifying service – Period of hostilities – Whether incurred danger from hostile forces of the enemy before Australian Forces withdrew – Obligations under section 33(1AA) of the *Administrative Appeals Tribunal Act* 1975 – Decision under review set aside.

Parkes and Repatriation Commission [2013] AATA 226; 16/4/2013; Senior Member RG Kenny

Pensions and benefits – Widow's pension – Operational service with Royal Australian Navy – Death from alcoholic cirrhosis – Statements of Principles – Clinical onset – Heavy alcohol consumption unrelated to eligible service – Reasonable hypothesis of relationship to eligible service not raised – Death not war-caused – Decision under review affirmed

# **Appeals Finalised**

This section of the Bulletin provides information about appeals against AAT decisions that have been lodged or finalised. Only appeals in relation to AAT decisions that have been published on <u>AustLII</u> have been included. Full copies of the decisions can be accessed through the hyperlinks provided below.

### **Appeals lodged**

| CASE NAME  | AAT REFERENCE   |
|--|-----------------|
| Comcare v Lofts  | [2013] AATA 122 |
| Frugtniet v Tax Practitioners Board                                  | [2013] AATA 188 |
| Commissioner of Taxation v Altnot Pty Ltd                            | [2013] AATA 140 |
| Agapis v Government of Western Australia Plumbers<br>Licensing Board | [2013] AATA 187 |
| Commissioner of Taxation v AAT & Walters & Walters                   | [2013] AATA 151 |

# Appeals finalised

| CASE NAME  | AAT REFERENCE   | COURT REFERENCE |
|--|-----------------|-----------------|
| Soames v Secretary, Department of<br>Families, Housing, Community<br>Services and Indigenous Affairs | [2012] AATA 107 | [2013] FCA 260  |
| Commissioner of Taxation v Nash  | [2012] AATA 719 | [2013] FCA 336  |
| Uelese v Minister for Immigration<br>And Citizenship & AAT   | [2012] AATA 793 | [2013] FCA 342  |



With the exception of the Commonwealth Coat of Arms and any third party material, this work is licensed under a <u>Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Australia Licence</u>. Content from this publication should be attributed as: Administrative Appeals Tribunal, *AAT Bulletin*.

To the extent that copyright subsists in third party material, it remains with the original owner and permission may be required to reuse the material.

The terms under which the Coat of Arms can be used are detailed on the following website: <u>http://www.itsanhonour.gov.au/coat-arms/</u>.

Enquiries regarding the licence are welcome at <u>aatweb@aat.gov.au</u>.

This licence is limited to the *AAT Bulletin* and does not extend to the full text of AAT decisions. Separate licence terms for AAT decisions can be found on <u>AustLII</u>. Those terms provide that section 182A of the *Copyright Act 1968* applies.